



Concordia Student Union - Council of Representatives  
CSU Regular Council Meeting  
Wednesday, February 09, 2022  
Via Zoom, 18h30

## 1. CALL TO ORDER

The chairperson calls the meeting to order at **18h36**.

---

**We would like to begin by acknowledging that Concordia University is located on unceded Indigenous lands. The Kanien'kehá:ka Nation is recognized as the custodians of the lands and waters on which we gather today. TiohEá:ke/Montreal is historically known as a gathering place for many First Nations. Today, it is home to a diverse population of Indigenous and other peoples. We respect the continued connections with the past, present, and future in our ongoing relationships with Indigenous and other peoples within the Montreal community.**

---

## 2. ROLL CALL

Council Chairperson: Caitlin Robinson

Council Minute Keeper: Michelle Lam

**Executives present for the meeting were:** Hannah Jamet-Lange (Academic & Advocacy Coordinator), Malcolm Asselin (Student Life Coordinator), Camina Harrison-Chéry (External Affairs & Mobilization Coordinator), Aria Khaksar (Finance Coordinator), S Shivaane (Loyola Coordinator), Harrison Kirshner (Internal Affairs Coordinator), Faye Sun (Sustainability Coordinator)

**Councilors present for the meeting were:** Katherine Bellini (Gina Cody School of Engineering), Alina Murad (Arts & Science), Boutaina Chafi (Arts & Science), Marissa Profetto (Gina Cody School of Engineering), Caleb Woolcott (Arts & Science), Christopher Vaccarella (Arts & Science), Lauren Perozek (John Molson School of Business), Wan Hua Li (Fine Arts), Edel Kilkenny-Mondoux (Arts & Science), Ikrame Housni (Arts & Science), Hassan Nabeel (Gina Cody School of Engineering), Olivia Integlia (Arts & Science), Paula Colmenares (Independent), Samuel Thibodeau (Fine Arts), Shania Bramble (Arts & Science), Brandon

Grimaldi (Arts & Science), Tzvi Hersh Filler (Independent), Lily Charette (Arts & Science), Nathaniel Ouazana (Arts & Science), Jeremy Deneault (John Molson School of Business)

**Councilors absent for the meeting were:** Noah Mohamed (John Molson School of Business), Ariane Drouin (Gina Cody School of Engineering), Emmanuel Gaisie (John Molson School of Business)

**Executives absent for the meeting were:** Eduardo Malorni (General Coordinator)

**Tzvi Hersh Filler** motions to excuse all absences from tonight's meeting. Seconded by **Christopher Vaccarella**. Motion passes.

### **3. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA**

**Katherine Bellini** motions to disallow CUTV to live stream the meeting. Seconded by **Harrison Kirshner**. Motion fails unanimously.

**Katherine Bellini:** It's already recorded, I don't see why it needs to be live streamed. Why livestream this meeting and not the others, especially when it's available to the public already

**Arya Afshar (CUTV):** Someone from the CSU asked us to livestream the event

**Lauren Perozek:** Who from the CSU requested it?

**Boutaina Chafi:** Can we vote on this?

**Ikrame Housni:** It's understandable because there is a motion being discussed that is important to a huge chunk of the student body, that is my assumption on why they want to live stream

**Katherine Bellini:** I don't mind it being live streamed, I was just wondering why we're doing it

### **4. CONSENT AGENDA**

**Katherine Bellini** motions to approve the agenda and all items under consent. Seconded by **Jeremy Asselin** Motion passes.

### **5. PRESENTATIONS AND GUEST SPEAKERS**

## 6. APPOINTMENTS

### a) Concordia Council on Student Life

**Malcolm Asselin:** We review project and student life funding requests from students. We'll meet two more times in the year

### b) Mental Health Committee

**Harrison Kirshner:** We operate on a consultation basis and we discuss mental health services on campus and preventative care. We meet every second Tuesday from 12-1pm

**Faye Sun:** We're working on ways to improve mental health services for students

**Tzvi Hersh Filler** presents the following motion. Seconded by **Jeremy Deneault**. Motion passes unanimously.

*BE IT RESOLVED* that the councilor seats on CCSL and Mental Health committees be opened to students at large, to be filled by the Appointments Committee

*BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED* budgetary impact of the motion is nil

**Tzvi Hersh Filler:** These seats have been offered to councilors multiple times and have not been filled. Let's offer it to students at large to fill

## 7. RETURNING BUSINESS - SUBSTANTIVE

## 8. NEW BUSINESS – SUBSTANTIVE

### a) Position Against Apartheid – Referendum

**Hassan Nabeel** presents the following motion. Seconded by **Boutaina Chafi**. Motion passes unanimously

*WHEREAS* the CSU represents the undergraduate student body at Concordia University;

*WHEREAS* it represents several Human Rights Issues such as BLM, LGBTQ2+, anti Semitism and Migrant rights that have all been sent to a vote before by the CSU Council;

*BE IT RESOLVED THAT THE* following question be sent to referendum in the 2022 election:

“Do you support the CSU to adopt a position against the practice of apartheid (as defined by leading human rights organization such as Human Rights Watch and Amnesty

International) and to divest from any investments and withdraw any financial or vocal support from states or businesses that are involved in apartheid?”

*BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED THE* budgetary impact of the motion is Nil.

*VOTE:*

*11 YES*

*1 NO*

*5 ABSTAIN*

*TZVI HERSH FILLER VOTED NO*

**Hassan Nabeel:** A great number of students have brought this to my attention. This motion is relevant given geopolitical situations. As a councilor, it is my responsibility to listen to student voices and represent them

**Harrison Kirshner:** Thank you for bringing forward this topic and discussion. It is important that we all agree on the fact that apartheid is bad. We have some questions, in good intent, to understand the position so that we are more aware of the question in the situation. My question is: can you clarify the part that focuses on divestment? Other positions in our book do not include divestment actions. What makes this position different to include divestment. How will the CSU enforce this?

**Hassan Nabeel:** What makes this distinct from others is that apartheid is a crime against humanity, it is not an umbrella term. Accusations of apartheid are serious and we can't have attempts to belittle it by hiding it behind definitions. Divestment is important in the anti apartheid movement.

**Harrison Kirshner:** I understand completely. How will CSU executives and councilors enforce this?

**Faye Sun:** According to a lot of international organizations, other countries can be considered to be operating under apartheid. Can you clarify how the CSU can be involved in this movement in a meaningful way?

**Christopher Vaccarella:** Some would argue that Canada is also an apartheid state. If Canada is deemed to be one by council, how would divestment work at the CSU?

**Boutaina Chafi:** It's not up to councilors to identify what is considered apartheid, we should leave that to international organizations.

**Lauren Perozek:** We're all against apartheid. Any opposition you hear tonight is not against apartheid, but to try to understand how this fits in with the CSU. How does this position differ from our position against systemic racism, which covers apartheid? What does this add in our position book that isn't already covered?

**Hassan Nabeel:** CSU executives are not the judges of what is apartheid. It is a serious crime

**Lauren Perozek:** What you just said doesn't answer my question

**Ikrame Housni:** This motion is trying to move positions into concrete actions.

**Lauren Perozek:** Positions are not meant to be mandates. The spirit of having concrete steps in a position is going against what positions are meant to be

**Haya Bitar:** I'm not in the CSU but want to voice my opinion. I second what Hassan and Boutaina have said so far. When Harrison asked "what's the point?", us even having to vote on this shows the state that we're in. We have to be anti apartheid. The CSU has power to censor clubs who support racism. It's not our place to define what apartheid is when international organizations can do so. The CSU can protest apartheid apologists, people who support apartheid. We all agree that we would never invite people on campus who are pro-residential schools, why can't we apply that same logic to apartheid?

**Wawa Li:** Canada has migrants and citizens from apartheid countries. Some are small business owners who sell products from their own country, including mine. How can we ensure this doesn't affect small business owners from these countries who are also against apartheid?

**Boutaina Chafi:** Only a small amount has been designated to be apartheid. The businesses you mentioned are going to be slightly or not even impacted by Concordia's decision. I wouldn't think the span of Concordia's businesses would affect small businesses in the Montreal community

**Jeremy Deneault:** My conception of apartheid was a minority inflicting systemic or institutionalized racism to a majority population. What do you mean by apartheid here?

**Boutaina Chafi:** You'll never see an international organization call a country racist, but it will call a country out for crimes of apartheid. That's the distinction

**Harrison Kirshner:** What is an example of some countries you're referring to? How will this affect student groups on campus if the objective is for this position to do so

**Hassan Nabeel:** It involves anything that is not supporting apartheid. We're not here to discuss geopolitical positions

**Harrison Kirshner:** What would classify as a club supporting apartheid?

**Hassan Nabeel:** We have a 10M fund we need to divest

**Harrison Kirshner:** I'm specifically talking about clubs

**Katherine Bellini:** Clubs are not supposed to support a crime against humanity, they're supposed to enrich student life. We shouldn't fund any club that is promoting hate speech.

**Cyrene Apaceli:** It's troubling that there's a fixation on small businesses theoretically being affected, but we don't extend the same courtesy to the millions of people being affected by apartheid

**Tzvi Hersh Filler:** You're not allowed to question someone's motivation

**Cyrene Apaceli:** Our priority should be centering people who are being affected by apartheid, and prioritize them over small businesses

**Center for Gender Advocacy:** What economic impact does the CSU have on small businesses?

**Lauren Perozek:** My role as a counselor is not to fight social causes. I'm concerned with how these positions will be carried out. How are we going to fulfill our promise with this position? Who will make the decision on which clubs and businesses to support and who to not support? Will we have a committee? How are we, as a union, supposed to evaluate that? I'd love to add this to the positions book but it should be done in a general way, instead of having specific actions that should be policies rather than a position

**Katherine Bellini:** We stand as the CSU against discrimination. We support Black Lives Matter, we support the LGBTQ+ community, we logically are against apartheid. In this motion, we are standing against systemic oppression. I support this motion.

**Harrison Kirshner:** I would like to know if this position means that certain clubs are meant to not have funding

**Alina Murad:** supporting apartheid would not enrich anyone's life. If a club is supporting a figure of apartheid or an apartheid state, the CSU should divest from that club

**Harrison Kirshner:** Does that mean cultural/ethnic clubs, who don't represent their government, will have to suffer the consequences of being defunded?

**Alina Murad:** If the club is directly enriching a supporter of apartheid, funding should be defunded.

**Harrison Kirshner:** So we're referring to events and actions

**Ikrame Housni:** If this motion passes, which I have faith it will, it's important for clubs to make a statement against apartheid. Divestment is the least we can do.

**Hannah Jamet-Lange:** It's important to not apply different standards to referendum questions. In the past, we have had referendum questions on positions with call to actions, and none of them were questioned to this extent on how it will be implemented

**Caleb Woolcott:** The CSU and Concordia has strong anti-discrimination policies. Discriminating against an ethnic club would be in violation of that. There is a SSAELC fund committee that deals with the CSU's investments. We can mandate them to invest responsibly based on recommendations by the UN

**Hadassah Alencar (The Concordian):** Are there states in mind to divest or withdraw support from?

**Hassan Nabeel:** The list follows the International Community guidelines.

**Hadassah Alencar (The Concordian):** Can you name one country?

**Hassan Nabeel:** The CSU doesn't take geopolitical positions so I can't name a country

**Lauren Perozek:** Can we have the definition that Hassan gave us in the position, so they have a definition while they vote? If students are voting on this, we should make it as easy for them as possible. A definition will help students understand clearly what they're voting for

**Lauren Perozek** motions to amend the motion to include a definition of apartheid. Seconded by **Jeremy Deneault**. Opposed by **Boutaina Chafi**.

**Boutaina Chafi:** The definition would make the question too long. We're all undergraduate students and are capable of researching ourselves.

**Ikrama Housni:** It's a great point to add the definition, but it would make it too long. To make it transparent, we need to put all the definitions of all the references, which would make the definition longer

**Katherine Bellini:** There's no need to define, it would be too long, but we can add it if she thinks we need it

**Jeremy Deneault:** Can we add a shortened definition?

**Hassan Nabeel:** I'm opposed to the amendment. The full definition will be too long and discourage voters from voting for it

**Aria Khaksar:** We should have the definition. Students do the bare minimum when they're voting. We want students to be informed and fully understand what they're voting for

**Nathaniel Ouazana:** How are we supposed to implement this if we can't take political stances?

**Lauren Perozek:** People aren't going to click on a link. Instead of the wording in the motion, could we have an asterisk next to the word *apartheid* and have the definition below the motion?

**Boutaina Chafi:** The definition is 500 words long . I wouldn't mind a summary of the idea, but it depends on how the council would feel about not having a full definition.

**Lauren Perozek** motions to amend their amendment to include the following definition, and a link to the full definition in the question. Seconded by **Tzvi Hersh Filler**. Opposed by **Katherine Bellini**. Motion carries unanimously.

The Apartheid Convention defines the crime against humanity of apartheid as “inhuman acts committed for the purpose of establishing and maintaining domination by one racial group of persons over any other racial group of persons and systematically oppressing them.” The Rome Statute of the ICC adopts a similar definition: “inhumane acts... committed in the context of an institutionalized regime of systematic oppression and domination by one racial group over any other racial group or groups and committed with the intention of maintaining that regime.” The Rome Statute does not further define what constitutes an “institutionalized regime.”

*VOTE:*



*15 YES*

*1 NO*

*1 ABSTAIN*

**Lauren Perozek:** This is a good balance between informing students while also respecting the length of the question

**Hassan Nabeel:** We're getting lost in the semantics. I trust that our students would go through with searching for the definition if they don't know

**Lauren Perozek:** I've already shortened the definition

**Ikrame Housni:** The purpose of this amendment is to inform students and make it easier for them. However, having to read that paragraph would discourage me from voting

**Lauren Perozek:** I picked this paragraph because it defines what apartheid is.

**Haya Bitar:** We're losing sight on what we're here to vote on

**Lauren Perozek** calls the question

**Hassan Nabeel:** Can we include Amnesty International and Human Rights Watch at the top?

**Christopher Vaccarella:** Who decides what clubs are upholding apartheid? Who decides how to sanction clubs?

**Ikrame Housni:** Groups who support apartheid will not be funded

**Christopher Vaccarella:** Who will enforce these rules?

**Katherine Bellini:** The Clubs and Spaces committee, the people of this council who receive proposals from groups. If the event or group is promoting hate, we have the responsibility to not support that

**Haya Bitar:** We've already gone over these points and provided answers, the responsibility is on the CSU. I hope we can move on. I've been to similar discussions and never seen this much debate or questioning of motives of other motions. Stop going in circles, the question is if you're for or against apartheid

**Hadassah Alencar:** Hassan mentioned that the CSU can't take geopolitical stances and Nathaniel asked "how are we supposed to implement this if we can't take political stances?" How will this be enforced?

**Hassan Nabeel:** We can't single out a country

**Aria Khaksar:** The club or the event will be defunded? Does that mean that a club has to propose an event for funding to the CSU every time to receive funding?

**Katherine Bellini:** If an event doesn't make sense, it won't be approved. Everything needs to be described in the proposal and budget to the VP of Clubs

**Aria Khaksar:** Thank you for explaining what a budget is, I'm actually the Finance Coordinator so I know how a budget works. So once a budget gets approved, they're allowed to do events in the budget, but not every event has to be presented?

**Katherine Bellini:** They can only carry out events that were proposed and approved

**Hassan Nabeel:** We already practice divestment at the CSU

**Caleb Woolcott** calls the question. Seconded by **Hassan Nabeel**. Opposed. Motion passes unanimously.

*VOTE:*

*11 YES*

*2 NO*

*3 ABSTAIN*

**Tzvi Hersh Filler:** Trust me, this will open a massive can of worms that you either cannot foresee or think will not happen. I stand by my "no" as your stance is to hurt people and to defund clubs.

**Lauren Perozek:** The CSU can choose to not grant funding, but that doesn't stop clubs from seeking their own funding. If they can source their own funding, the CSU has no jurisdiction over how they spend their money

## **9. NEW BUSINESS – INFORMATIONAL**

## **10. QUESTION PERIOD & BUSINESS ARISING**

**Hannah Jamet-Lange** motions to amend the motion previously adopted in appointments to notwithstanding section 4.1.9 from the policy on executive, council, and committees. Seconded. Motion passes unanimously.

**Mohamad Abdallah:** After what Hersh said, I condemn apartheid. I share the concerns of Hersh on the defunding of clubs, which is a polarizing issue. This will create conflict between students, which we should avoid. How do we know this committee has qualified people who can act without bias?

**Ikrame Housni:** It's not in the hands of a committee, it will be clear guidelines

**Tzvi Hersh Filler:** This can of worms being opened will impact a lot of clubs.

## **11. ANNOUNCEMENTS**

**Aria Khaksar:** Reggies is now open

**Jeremy Deneault:** Space Concordia has had four events so far that have gone smoothly, proof that we can function. We'll be going up from here

**S Shivaane:** FOCUS and CUTAM are both doing movie nights this Friday

**Center for Gender Advocacy:** There will be a march to honor the missing Indigenous women meeting at Cabot Square at 6 PM on Valentines Day

## **12. ADJOURNMENT**

**Lauren Perozek** moves to adjourn the meeting. Seconded by **Aria Khaksar**. Motion carries.

Meeting adjourned at 9:02 PM.